

Date of Public Summary: February 2011

**PUBLIC SUMMARY OF FIRST SURVEILLANCE AUDIT OF  
NEGERI SEMBILAN STATE FOREST MANAGEMENT UNIT  
FOR FOREST MANAGEMENT CERTIFICATION**

Certificate No	: FMC 002
Date of Certification	: 29 December 2009
Date of Surveillance Audit	: 21-23 July 2010

**Certification Body:**

**SIRIM QAS International Sdn Bhd  
Block 4, SIRIM Complex  
1, Persiaran Dato' Menteri  
Section 2, P. O. Box 7035  
40700 Shah Alam  
Selangor, MALAYSIA**

**Tel : +60 3 5544 6400  
+60 3 5544 6448  
Fax : +60 3 5544 6763  
E-Mail : radziah\_mohd.daud@sirim.my**

## **1. INTRODUCTION**

A surveillance audit on the Negeri Sembilan State Forest Management Unit (hereafter referred to as 'the Negeri Sembilan FMU') was conducted from 21 to 23 July 2010. This is an audit to assess the continued overall compliance of the Negeri Sembilan State Forest Department (NSSFD)'s forest management system and practices of the Permanent Reserved Forest (PRF) within the Negeri Sembilan FMU against the requirements of the *Malaysian Criteria and Indicators for Forest Management Certification [MC&I (2002)]*, the standard used for forest management certification under the Malaysian Timber Certification Scheme (MTCS), using the verifiers stipulated for Peninsular Malaysia.

This audit was carried out following the Stage 2 Audit that was conducted on the FMU on 27-31 July 2009 which had resulted in the award of a *Certificate for Forest Management* to the NSSFD as no major NCRs had been raised.

The Negeri Sembilan FMU comprises of 155,531 hectares (ha) of PRF of the state's total land area of 664,591 ha. The size of the FMU had increased since the last audit with the gazettelement of 1,149 ha of Stateland forest as PRF in the Serjing Forest Reserve (FR). Another 1,527 ha has been proposed to be gazetted as PRF.

The PRF consists mainly of inland forest with a small area of 215 ha of Beach Forest while the mangrove forest in the State is under Stateland. The inland PRF consists mainly of Hill and Upper Hill Dipterocarp Forests with patches of Lowland Dipterocarp which are currently protected mainly for research purposes.

## **2. GENERAL SUMMARY**

### **2.1 Name of FMU**

Negeri Sembilan State FMU

### **2.2 Contact Person and Address**

Mr. Hamidi Abd Halim  
Assistant Director of Forestry  
Negeri Sembilan State Forestry Department  
Level 4, Block C, Wisma Negeri  
Jalan Dato' Abdul Malek  
70503 Seremban  
NEGERI SEMBILAN

Tel : 06-765 9849  
Fax : 06-762 3711  
E-mail : hamidi@forestry.gov.my

### **2.3 Dates of Surveillance Audit:**

21 – 23 July 2010 (6 man-days)

### **2.4 Audit Team**

Mr. Samsudin Musa (Audit Team Leader)  
Mr. Khairul Najwan Ahmad Jahari (Auditor)

## 2.5 Standards Used

*Malaysian Criteria and Indicators for Forest Management Certification [MC&I (2002)]* using the verifiers stipulated for Peninsular Malaysia.

## 2.6 Stakeholder Consultation

A stakeholder consultation through invitation to comment on the management of the Negeri Sembilan FMU was conducted in June 2010 for a period of one month. Comments by stakeholders and responses from the audit team are attached in **Annex 1**.

## 3. SUMMARY OF SURVEILLANCE AUDIT FINDINGS

Based on the surveillance audit conducted, it was found that the NSSFD had generally continued to comply with most of the requirements of the *MC&I* (2002). However, the surveillance audit had raised two (2) minor Non Conformity Reports (NCRs) and two (2) Opportunity for Improvements (OFIs).

It was also found that the NSSFD had taken the appropriate corrective actions to address the 5 minor NCRs raised in the Stage 2 audit. The audit team was satisfied with the corrective actions taken by the NSSFD and had consequently agreed to close all these NCRs. The details on the status of the NCRs and OFIs raised during the previous Stage 2 audit, and the new NCRs and OFIs raised during this surveillance audit are attached in **Annex 2**.

The NSSFD had submitted corrective action plans on the NCRs and OFIs raised on 26 August 2010 which had been accepted by the audit team leader. These proposed corrective actions by the NSSFD to address the minor NCRs and OFIs shall be verified by the audit team during the next surveillance audit.

As no Major NCR had been raised, the audit team had therefore recommended that the *Certificate for Forest Management* awarded to NSSFD be maintained.

**Comments by Stakeholders and Responses by the Audit Team**

No	Name	Date Received	Detail of Issue Raised	Comments by Audit Team Leader
1.	Stakeholder 1	19 July 2010	<p><b>We</b> recognise that the FMU was certified by SIRIM following the Stage 2 forest certification audit conducted in July 2009 and will be undergoing a surveillance audit in July 2010. In this regard, <b>we</b> would like to provide the following comments:</p> <p>There had been several Minor NCRs and OFIs issued during the last audit that could assist the Negeri Sembilan Forestry Department further enhance their capacity in the management of the FMU in a sustainable manner. We hope these aspects will be reviewed by the surveillance audit team. <b>We are</b> willing to cooperate with the Negeri Sembilan Forestry Department in aspects where research inputs are needed.</p>	<p><i>All corrective actions taken by the NSSFD to address the Minor NCRs and OFIs issued during the Stage 2 Audit will be verified for closing during this surveillance audit.</i></p>
			<p>We are pleased to inform that the Negeri Sembilan Forestry Department had been supportive of forestry research as <b>we have</b> an important research site in Pasoh. Many local and international scientists have already conducted research in the site. We hope that the research output will support Negeri Sembilan Forestry Department in improving forest management of the FMU. <b>We are</b> ready</p>	<p><i>This aspect was highlighted to the NSSFD. The research being conducted in Pasoh will be reviewed and the NSSFD is expected to participate in the upcoming Pasoh International Symposium in November 2010.</i></p>

			to provide any input in this regard if requested.	
			The recovery of forest after logging is an important factor in ensuring sustainable management of the FMU. Recovery of the forest entails productivity (yield in terms of volume or basal area), as well as species composition and diversity (both flora and fauna). In this regard, analysis of information from growth and yield plots would be useful to monitor forest recovery. Another aspect that could yield useful information is the comparison pre-felling and post felling inventory data.	<i>This aspect has been inspected during the audit. There has been some limited analysis conducted by the NSSFD on the comparison of stocking before and after felling. However, an OFI has been raised on this to ensure a more systematic and comprehensive analysis be conducted.</i>
			Many of the forest areas open for logging are second rotation forests. The management of such forests is more challenging. Since forest management under the MUS/SMS have specific cutting cycles, information on logging history of compartments are useful to prevent early entry. Records such as cutting limits applied, pre-felling stocking, stocking removed and post felling stocking are useful to monitor sustainability. Such information will have to be considered in the management of second rotation forests.	<i>Records of logging histories on the compartments were being kept in the 'Rancangan Tebangan dan Rancangan Tanaman' (RTRT) or Planned Harvesting and Planned Planting records. However, more detailed information on the original stocking was not available. The NSSFD had indicated that currently, records and inventory information of the compartments being harvested are available.</i>
			<b>We are</b> ready to work with the Negeri Sembilan Forestry Department in areas of research that will support the Department's efforts in managing the	<i>The surveillance audit was conducted professionally against the requirements of the MC&amp;I (2002).</i>

			FMU on a sustainable basis. <b>We</b> hope that the certification will be conducted properly and will be an on-going process that will see continual improvement in the management of forests.	
2.	<b>Stakeholder 2</b>		<p>Streamlining of forest management based on the Master Plan on Ecological Networks published by the Department of Town and Country Planning, Ministry of Housing and Local Government on the conservation of nature and environment, protection and management of watershed area, exploitation of eco-tourism and recreation and integrated forest management between states and increase performance of resources management at the international fora.</p> <p>We request the forest management unit to consider the risk of the local community and the public being disturbed by wildlife in the forest areas being logged as logging operations may cause wildlife such as monkey, primate, tiger and others being displaced by logging operation to come into nearby villages or housing estates.</p>	<p><i>These aspects were difficult to validate as there are no clear evidences that selective logging in PRFs is causing displacement of animals. Discussions with PERHILITAN revealed that their comments were more relevant for areas that are being clear felled.</i></p> <p><i>Further consultation between PERHILITAN and the NSSFD is needed to discuss this issue.</i></p> <p><i>An OFI has been raised to promote greater consultations between the two agencies to address such concerns</i></p>
			The responsible logging contractors should provide some allocation as compensation to the local community living within the vicinity of the forest from damage caused by wildlife as a result of logging operations. They should also provide facilities such as animal traps to the villagers being disturbed by wildlife	<p><i>Further consultation between PERHILITAN and the NSSFD is needed to discuss this issue.</i></p> <p><i>An OFI has been raised to promote greater consultations between the two agencies to address such concerns.</i></p>

			resulting from logging operations.	
			<p>Closing of all access roads to the forest after the expiry of the logging licence as these roads will normally provide easy access to vehicles used by illegal hunters</p> <p>Seek the corporation of the State Forestry Department to prepare an inventory report on the distribution of wildlife in the logged over forests in the FMU for the record of the State Wildlife and National Park Department for the management wildlife and biodiversity in the state.</p> <p>Example: Tiger, Guning Tampin Forest Reserve, Compartment 24 X:234567, Y:402987</p>	<p><i>This aspect had been raised and the NSSFD had indicated that they will provide such information if available.</i></p>
3.	Stakeholder 3	13 Nov 2009	<p>With reference to the above and to your letter dated 15 June 2009, <b>we</b> would like to submit a list of threatened species found in Negeri Sembilan for your intention.</p> <p>We provide the localities where the species is found. We are uncertain as to whether these localities are sited within the FMU that were audited. We note however that the auditors are familiar with many of the species listed and these are easily recognized from their field characters.</p> <p>The list was derived from work done on the project entitled "safeguarding the</p>	<p><i>The NSSFD had already earmarked the site of the rare Vatica yeechongii in the Setul FR as HCVF and had erected fencing around the site for its protection. The NSSFD had also requested (letter dated 20<sup>th</sup> July 2010) further assistance from FRIM on identifying rare, endangered and threatened species as well as their localities to enable them provide greater protection to such species. In particular, the NSSFD had requested the location of the Begonia tampinica.</i></p>

			<p>Forest Plant Diversity of Peninsular Malaysia. (b) Conservation Monitoring of Rare and Threatened Plants of Peninsular Malaysia". This Project is funded by the Ministry of Science, Technology and Innovation. The List covers two critical families in Peninsular Malaysia, i.e., <i>Dipterocarpaceae</i> and <i>Begoniaceae</i>. <i>Dipterocarpaceae</i> is an Important timber family while <i>Begoniaceae</i> has a large number of endemic species most of which are hyper endemic, rare and endangered.</p>	
--	--	--	---	--



**Status of NCRs and OFIs Issued In Previous Stage 2 Audit and  
Issuance of New NCRs and OFIs in this Surveillance Audit****Status of NCRs and OFIs Issued in Previous Stage 2 Audit**

<b>Indicator</b>	<b>NCR No.</b>	<b>Non-Compliance</b>	<b>Corrective Actions Taken</b>	<b>Status</b>
5.3.2	Minor NCR 1	<p>In the logging operation within Compartment 47C of the Pasoh Forest Reserve, there were trees felled but the logs were not taken out as they were found to be hollow.</p>	<p>To avoid recurrence of such product wastage, the NSSFD had proposed that logging operations would be allowed in smaller parcels amounting to about 50 ha. Continuation of logging operations to subsequent parcels would only be allowed after the NSSFD had inspected the completed parcels and was satisfied that there was no product wastage.</p> <p>It was observed at the completed logging sites in Compartments 134 and 135 of the Pasoh FR that the logging contractors had been more careful and had not left any logs in the site as waste.</p>	<b>Closed</b>
5.5.2	Minor NCR 2	<p>Road construction in not in full compliance to the RIL specifications.</p> <p>In the inspection of Compartment 47C of the Pasoh Forest Reserve, the auditors had found that in the construction of roads, earth that has been pushed to the side of the road was not compacted there was also one part of a new feeder road that had a gradient of 18 degrees. This exceeded the maximum allowable gradient for feeder roads.</p>	<p>In this surveillance audit, it was found that the NSSFD had taken corrective actions to ensure that road construction in the subsequent blocks had not exceeded the maximum gradient allowed under the RIL guidelines. Evidence of communication to this effect was made available as evident by the results of inspection by the Engineering Unit of the Forestry Department Peninsular Malaysia Headquarters on the approval of new roads.</p> <p>Where old roads were to be used and if they exceed the maximum gradient allowed, prior approval would</p>	<b>Closed</b>

			<p>be required from the NSSFD. In addition, the NSSFD had sent its staff from the road engineering unit for training on road construction.</p> <p>During an inspection to the completed logging sites in Compartments 134 and 135 of the Pasoh FR, the auditors had found that the construction of roads had been done according to specifications not exceeding the maximum allowable slope.</p>	
6.5.1	Minor NCR 3	It was observed within Compartment 47C of the Pasoh Forest Reserve that there were skid trails with heavy blading.	<p>The NSSFD had briefed the contractors involved (License NT 01/02/2009) and had issued fines of RM500 failing which the contractor would be blacklisted. It was also found that there was greater monitoring by the NSSFD on the road construction in subsequent logging sites in Compartments 134 and 135 of the Pasoh FR. A report on the monitoring was made available.</p> <p>During the inspection on recently logged-over areas in Compartments 134 and 135 of the Pasoh FR, the auditors had found that there was no heavy blading of the skid trails. Consultation held with the logging contractors had indicated that they had been made aware of the need to minimize blading during the construction of skid trails.</p>	<b>Closed</b>
6.5.3	Minor NCR 4	There were insufficient sumps and no cross drains in the active logging area. The sumps that were constructed were also not according to specifications.	The NSSFD had briefed the contractors on the need to follow the RIL Guidelines. It was also found that there was greater monitoring by the NSSFD on the road construction in subsequent logging sites in Compartments 134 and 135 of the Pasoh FR. A report on the monitoring of road construction by the NSSFD Engineering Unit was made available.	<b>Closed</b>

			During the inspection on recently logged-over areas in Compartments 134 and 135 of the Pasoh FR, the auditors had found that sumps and cross drains had been properly constructed accordingly. The audit team was informed by the logging contractors that they had been briefed and made aware of the need to construct proper sumps and cross drains.	
8.3.1	Minor NCR 5	Errors were observed in the recording of the log number and name of the log specie in the Removal Passes issued at the Forest Checking Station.	<p>During the inspection on the logged over areas in Compartments 134 and 135 of the Pasoh FR, it was found that the Tree Tagging and Timber Production Control Book were in good order based on comparison of tag numbers of felled trees identified in the field by the auditors. However, since there were no active logging operations during the audit, verification of information in Removal Passes against that recorded in the Tree Tagging and Timber Production Control Book could not be conducted.</p> <p>It was also learnt that personnel who worked in the checking stations had been briefed and would be sent for training on "<i>Kursus Balai Pemeriksaan Hutan</i>" scheduled to be held on 21-23 September 2010.</p>	<b>Closed</b>
1.5.2	OFI 1	The Negeri Sembilan State Forestry Department has maintained clear boundary marking of all forest reserves inspected with boundary trees marked with red paint. Actions have also been taken through consultations with the local communities on illegal settlements. These actions could be enhanced through more signage to indicate the	<p>It was observed that the NSSFD had established clear boundaries and erected additional plates particularly along easily accessible areas in the Sg. Menyala FR.</p> <p>The NSSFD had also marked the boundaries of all forest reserves by painting boundary trees with red paint. This was observed in the Pasoh and Triang FRs. Actions have also been taken on illegal settlements through consultations with the local communities.</p>	<b>Closed</b>

		boundary of the Permanent Reserved Forests, especially at areas next to agricultural land as in the Triang and Sg. Menyala Forest Reserves.		
6.5.1	OFI 2	During an inspection to an active logging site in Compartment 47C of the Pasoh Forest Reserve, the auditors had found that the construction of roads was not in full compliance of the RIL specifications. The earth that was pushed to the side of the road was not compacted using an excavator. There was also one part of the feeder road that has a gradient of 18 degrees which exceeds the maximum allowable gradient for such road.	<p>The NSSFD had taken action to send three of its staff from the Forest Engineering Unit to attend a training on forest road construction organized by the Forestry Department Headquarters Peninsular Malaysia on 17-19 August 2009 in Cameron Highlands while the workers of the logging contractors had attended training on the requirements of <i>MC&amp;I</i> (2002).</p> <p>In addition, during an inspection to the completed logging sites in Compartments 134 and 135 of the Pasoh FR, the auditors had found that the construction of roads had been done according to the RIL specifications and that the staff involved were knowledgeable on the road specifications.</p>	<b>Closed</b>
9.1.1	OFI 3	The management and monitoring guidelines for HCVF have been prepared for the Sg. Menyala and Vatica plot. It is recommended that the research plot in Pasoh Forest Reserve be included as a HCVF site owing to its long history of national and international research activities.	The NSSFD had agreed to include the current research site in Pasoh FR encompassing the 50-ha long term ecological plot a potential HCVF site. A meeting has been arranged with FRIM on 30 <sup>th</sup> July 2010 to discuss this matter. The director of the NSSFD had also conducted a survey of the proposed site.	<b>Closed</b>
9.3.1	OFI 4	Boundaries of HCVFs are clearly demarcated on ground and in maps. This could be further improved in the Vatica plot with fencing as the site is	During the visit to the site, the auditors had found that fencing had been erected around the site and a sign board has been placed clearly depicting the HCVF site.	<b>Closed</b>

		exposed to major infrastructure development and next to the main road.		
7.2.2	OFI 5	It is recommended that efforts be enhanced to incorporate new scientific information based on research results and findings. These include growth and mortality rates as well as stocking and composition of second growth forests as discussed during the visit of the senior officers of the State Forestry Department to Sg. Menyala Forest Reserve.	The NSSFD had taken steps to address this issue with the Forestry Department Headquarters and plans to implement the results during the forthcoming RMK10	<b>Closed</b>
8.2.1	OFI 6	<p>The auditors have found there were some discrepancies in the location of marked trees in the tree location map in quadrants 5 and 6 during the inspection to the growth plot in Compartment 12A of Sg. Menyala Forest Reserve.</p> <p>It is recommended that the tree mapping be rechecked and corrected.</p>	This aspect was investigated by the NSSFD and a new plan has been developed with correct positioning of the trees. Apparently the confusion was caused by improper orientation of the map.	<b>Closed</b>
4.2.4	OFI 7	<p>The existing form contains records on attendance and remarks. Only if the worker is absent from work will the reason is recorded in the remark section.</p> <p>It is recommended that the present documentation system be improved by maintaining a monthly record on occurrence of accidents or no accidents.</p>	The NSSFD had updated the forms to include attendance, sick leave as well occurrence of accidents. A copy of the forms was made available.	<b>Closed</b>

4.4.1	OFI 8	<p>A social impact assessment entitled '<i>Penilaian Impak Sosial (Social Impact Assessment) Kawasan Pengusahhasilan Sebahagian Kompartment 19 Hutan Simpan Senaling Inas Kepada Sama Prima Sdn Bhd Seluas 32 Hektar</i>' was prepared.</p> <p>It is recommended that this report be dated, the methods of data collection and sources of data be outlined. The dependence on the forest by the local Orang Asli and Malay communities be defined.</p>	<p>The social impact forms for Compartments 134 and 135 Pasoh FR were inspected. The auditors found that the social impacts forms have been updated. The forms were now dated and duly signed and there were remarks on the sources of the data.</p>	<b>Closed</b>
8.1.2	OFI 9	<p>A special form entitled '<i>Panduan Maklumat Impak Sosial Dalam Sektor Pembalakan: Kesan Terhadap Faktor Sosial</i>' has been used to monitor the social impacts. The form contains information on economic, infrastructure and other social impacts.</p> <p>It is recommended that the form may be improved by adding any potential impacts on the water sources used by the local communities. The presence of burial ground (if any) be determined and the use of non-timber forest produce be recorded.</p> <p>The form should be signed by the relevant staff of the State Forestry Department and the date recorded.</p>	<p>The NSSFD had indicated that this aspect will be incorporated in future assessments. An inspection of the social impact forms for logged-over compartments 134 and 135 indicated that the forms had incorporated potential impacts and have been duly signed and dated.</p>	<b>Closed</b>



### Issuance of New NCRs and OFIs in this Surveillance Audit

#### NCRs:

Indicator	NCR No.	Status	Summary of Non Compliance
6.5.2	1	Minor	The construction of skid trails had not adhered to that drawn on the harvesting plans. There was no application made by the logging contractor for changes in the alignment of skid trails and as such no approvals were given by the District forest office.
6.5.4	2	Minor	There was wood debris in the buffer zone near log landing no. 4. A tree was also felled into the buffer zone causing some damage to the buffer zone

#### **Opportunities for Improvement:**

Indicator	OFI No.	Status	Summary of OFI
6.2.3	1	-	<p>There was a need for cooperation between the NSFD and PERHILITAN to be further enhanced to ensure better control and to reduce the incidences of encroachment.</p> <p>It was also found that there was misinterpretation of management system and harvesting impacts on fauna and that the hunting permits issued by PERHILITAN had not specified the prohibition of hunting in the PRFs.</p>
6.3.1	2	-	Current post felling assessments have not included an analysis of stocking and species composition before and after felling to ascertain the maintenance of ecological functions and values. However, some analysis had been undertaken by the NSFD to compare pre-felling and post felling inventory stocking. Such analysis should be further improved. In addition, a procedure should be in place to undertake systematic analysis of pre-felling and post felling inventory data to provide holistic and accurate picture of the maintenance of ecosystem integrity based on the requirements of SMS.