

**PUBLIC SUMMARY OF RECERTIFICATION AUDIT OF
NEGERI SEMBILAN FOREST MANAGEMENT UNIT
FOR FOREST MANAGEMENT CERTIFICATION**

**Certificate No : FMC 002
Date of Recertification Audit : 3-7 September 2012**

Certification Body:

**SIRIM QAS International Sdn Bhd
Block 4, SIRIM Complex
1, Persiaran Dato' Menteri
Section 2, P. O. Box 7035
40700 Shah Alam
Selangor, MALAYSIA**

**Tel: +60 3 5544 6400
+60 3 5544 6448
Fax: +60 3 5544 6763
Email: radziah_mohd.daud@sirim.my**

1. INTRODUCTION

The Negeri Sembilan Forest Management Unit (hereafter referred to as 'the Negeri Sembilan FMU') was awarded the *Certificate for Forest Management* against the MC&I (2002) following the Stage 2 Audit that was conducted on 27-31 July 2009. Following the certification, the first surveillance audit was conducted on 21-23 July 2010, while the second surveillance audit on 13-15 July 2011.

The recertification audit on the Negeri Sembilan FMU was conducted from 3-7 September 2012. This was an audit to assess the continued overall compliance of the Negeri Sembilan State Forestry Department (NSSFD)'s forest management system and practices of the Permanent Reserved Forests (PRFs) within the Negeri Sembilan FMU against the requirements of the *Malaysian Criteria and Indicators for Forest Management Certification* [MC&I (2002)]. In line with the transition plan from the use of MC&I (2002) to MC&I (Natural Forest), the recertification audit also included the MC&I (Natural Forest) in its audit scope.

This recertification audit was conducted by a three-member team comprising Mr. Khairul Najwan Ahmad Jahari (Forester), Dr. S.K. Yap (Forester/Ecologist) and Dr Lim Hin Fui (Sociologist). The audit commenced with an opening meeting on 3 September 2012 at the NSSFD's Head Office in Seremban.

The scope of the audit was limited to the forest management system and practices of the natural forest within the PRFs of the FMU. In addition to assessing the FMU's compliance to the certification standard, the audit team also verified the corrective actions taken by the NSSFD to close the minor Non-Conformity Reports (NCRs) and Opportunity for Improvements (OFIs) which had been raised during the second surveillance audit.

The NSSFD had taken the appropriate corrective actions to address the three (3) minor NCRs and four (4) OFIs raised in the second surveillance audit. The audit team was satisfied with the corrective actions taken by the NSSFD and had consequently agreed to close all the NCRs and OFIs raised.

In general, this recertification audit has found that the NSSFD has continued to comply with the requirements of the MC&I (2002) and the MC&I (Natural Forest). However, lapses were noted which resulted in the raising of six (6) minor NCRs and ten (10) OFIs.

As no major NCR was raised, it was recommended that the *Certificate for Forest Management* awarded to NSSFD be renewed upon the acceptance of the proposed corrective actions from the NSSFD by SIRIM QAS International to address the minor NCRs and OFIs within a month from the last day of the recertification audit.

2. GENERAL SUMMARY

2.1 Name of FMU

Negeri Sembilan FMU

2.2 Contact Person and Address

Mr. Ahmad Fadzil Abdul Majid
Director of Forestry
Negeri Sembilan State Forestry Department
Level 4, Blok C, Wisma Negeri
Jalan Dato' Abdul Malek
70503 Seremban
NEGERI SEMBILAN

Tel : 06-765 9849
Fax : 06-762 3711
E-mail : fadzil@forestry.gov.my

2.3 Date of Recertification Audit

3-7 September 2012 (15 auditor days)

2.4 Audit Team

Mr. Khairul Najwan Ahmad Jahari (Lead Auditor)
Dr. Yap Son Kheong (Auditor)
Dr. Lim Hin Fui (Auditor)

2.5 Standards Used

Malaysian Criteria and Indicators for Forest Management Certification [MC&I (2002)] and
Malaysian Criteria and Indicators for Forest Management Certification [MC&I (Natural Forest)]

2.6 Stakeholder Consultation

A stakeholder consultation was conducted in July 2012 for a period of one month. The comments by the stakeholders and responses from the audit team are shown in **Attachment 1**.

3. Negeri Sembilan Forest Management Unit

The Negeri Sembilan FMU managed by the NSSFD comprises of 154,577 ha of PRFs of the state's total land area of 665,709 ha. The figure of the FMU has changed to 154,577 ha, compared to the first surveillance audit in 2011, which are originally 153,459 ha. This is due to the Forestry Department Peninsular Malaysia Head Quarters had updated (digitized) the forest mapping of forest reserves in the Negeri Sembilan State.

The PRFs consists mainly of inland forest with a small area of 215 ha of Beach Forest while the Mangrove Forest is under Stateland. The inland PRF consists mainly of Hill and Upper Hill Dipterocarp Forests, with patches of Lowland Dipterocarp which are protected mainly for research purposes.

The administration of the FMU is divided into two forest districts, namely East Negeri Sembilan and West Negeri Sembilan Forest Districts. The map of the FMU is shown as **Attachment 2**.

A Forest Management Plan (FMP) covering the period from 2006 to 2015 was presented during the audit. The Negeri Sembilan FMU continues to be managed on a sustainable basis with the inland PRFs under a Selective Management System (SMS) over on a 30-year rotation period.

4. SUMMARY OF RECERTIFICATION AUDIT FINDINGS

The overall findings of the recertification audit indicated that the Negeri Sembilan FMU continues to fulfill the requirements of the MC&I(2002) and the MC&I (Natural Forest). A total of six (6) new Minor NCRs and 10 OFIs were raised during the recertification audit.

The audit team also verified the corrective actions taken by the NSSFD to address all the three (3) Minor NCRs and four (4) OFIs raised during the second surveillance audit in 2011. The audit team has verified that the corrective actions taken by the NSSFD are appropriate and adequate to address the NCRs and OFIs raised. As such, the audit team closed out the minor NCRs and OFIs raised during the second surveillance audit. Details of the status of the NCRs and OFIs raised during the second surveillance audit as well as those raised during the recertification audit are shown in **Attachment 3**.

With regard to the implementation of the instruction related to Criterion 6.10, there has been no new conversion of the natural forest to forest plantations or non-forest land use since the second surveillance audit in 2011. As for the instruction related to indigenous peoples' rights, NSSFD has continued to undertake both formal and informal consultations with the Orang Asli communities on matters affecting their customary, legal and use rights as a result of the forest management operations.

The NSSFD had submitted a corrective action plan on 20 November 2012 to address the Minor NCRs and OFIs that was accepted by the audit team leader. The proposed corrective actions to address the Minor NCRs and OFIs shall be verified by the audit team during the next surveillance audit.

As there was no major NCR raised and all the NCRs raised during the second surveillance audit had been satisfactorily closed out, it is therefore recommended that the *Certificate for Forest Management* be awarded to the NSSFD be renewed.

Comments by Stakeholders and Responses from Audit Team

| No. | Stakeholder | Comments/Issues Raised | Response by Audit Team |
|------------|--------------------|--|--|
| 1 | Stakeholder 1 | <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Hutan sebagai habitat hidupan liar serta koridor-koridor bagi memastikan ekologi hutan yang lebih sihat2. Pengurusan konflik hidupan liar & manusia3. Akta Pemuliharaan Hidupan Liar 2010 | <p>Assessment consultation with the Stakeholder 1 showed that the NSSFD had made arrangements with the former in patrolling to control poaching. The loggers were also proactive in obtaining wildlife posters from the Stakeholder 1 to be displayed at the workers' camp to raise awareness of the endangered, rare and threatened species to their workers as well as to forbid hunting.</p> <p>As conclusion, there were no issues with the Stakeholder 1.</p> |
| 2 | Stakeholder 2 | <p>A complaint was lodged by a stakeholder complaining that the logging activities in the nearby area had brought road problems to the Orang Asli living in Kg. Ulu Lakai.</p> | <p>Assessment consultation with the 38 Orang Asli villagers in Kg Ulu Lakai and the contractor showed that action had been taken to repair the damaged portions of the access road. The Orang Asli community had expressed satisfaction with the outcome of the consultation.</p> <p>As conclusion, the issue was resolved by the contractor.</p> |

Status of NCRs and OFIs issued during Second Surveillance Audit in 2011 against the MC&I(2002)

NCRs

| Indicator | NCR No. | Non-Compliance | Corrective Action Taken | Verification by Auditor |
|------------------|----------------|--|--|--------------------------------|
| Indicator 6.3.1 | 1 (Minor) | The comparison between the Pre-F and Post-F inventory data of Compartment 7, Triang Forest Reserve presented during this surveillance audit had not arrived at a conclusion on the impact of harvesting on the species composition and tree sizes. A continuous monitoring of the plots would be required to assess the impacts. | The NSSFD had provided the comparison conducted for Compartment 46, Pasoh Forest Reserve (FR) and Compartment 7, Triang FR indicating the impact of harvesting on species composition and tree size. As the assessment was done just after harvesting preliminary analysis did not indicate any changes. | Closed |
| Indicator 8.3.1 | 2 (Minor) | During the inspection at the Pasoh Mobile Forest Checking Station, it was found that the logs had been labeled correctly in accordance with the Tree Tagging and Timber Production Record Book. The information in the RPs, however, could not be verified against that recorded in the Tree Tagging and Timber Production Control Book. This was caused by the absence of tree tagging numbers on RPs No L514068 dated 12.7.2011 and No. L514051 dated 11.7.2011 under license of NT/01/03/2010. This had resulted in the inability of tracing the logs coming out of the harvesting site thus breaking the Chain of Custody (CoC) process. | During inspection at Petaseh Mobile Forest Checking Station, it was found the tree tagging numbers were manually recorded in the Removal Passes and matched those recorded in the Tree Tagging and Timber Production Record Book. The traceability of the coming out logs was restored. | Closed |
| Indicator 9.3.2 | 3 (Minor) | Inventories of flora and biological diversity within Sungai Menyala HCVF site had been conducted in 2009 and 2010. However, a | Updated in the public summary | Closed |

| | | | | |
|--|--|---|--|--|
| | | summary of the findings had not been presented in the publicly available summary. | | |
|--|--|---|--|--|

OFIs

| Indicator | OFI No. | Summary of OFI | Corrective Action Taken | Verification by Auditor |
|------------------|---------|--|---|-------------------------|
| Indicator 1.5.2 | OFI 1 | More signages could be erected along the boundaries of forest reserves especially along sites bordering alienated land as seen in the Sungai Menyala Forest Reserve and Gunong Angsi Forest Reserve. | Adequate signages had been erected along the boundaries of the Pasoh FR | Closed |
| Indicator 6.3.2 | OFI 2 | The enrichment planting trial in the Tebong Forest Reserve could be elevated into a permanent plot for monitoring of indigenous forest species planting in logged-over forest. Data collected would support the enrichment planting programme. | Elevated as a permanent sample plot. Inventory had been carried out | Closed |
| Indicator 6.10.2 | OFI 3 | The alienation of forest reserves was documented in the compilation of gazette notices. This process could be enhanced by providing an up-to-date summary of the areas alienated and a map on the remaining forest reserves in the publicly available summary. | Action has been taken by the Peninsular Malaysia Forestry Department Head Quarters by re-aligning and updating the forest mapping of all forest reserves in the different states. | Closed |
| Indicator 8.5.1 | OFI 4 | Analysis of the growth plots and comparison of pre-F and post-F tree numbers had been completed. This could be included in the public summary made available to interested stakeholders. | An analysis of the growth plots and comparison of pre-F and post-F tree numbers had been completed and the results had been updated in the public summary. Preliminary analysis was in Triang Forest Reserve Compartment 7 in 2010. | Closed |

Issuance of New NCRs and OFIs during Recertification Audit in 2012 against the MC&I(Natural Forest) NCRs

| Indicator | NCR No. | Status | Summary of Non-Compliance |
|-----------|---------|--------|--|
| 1.1.2 | LIM-1 | Minor | <p>Forest managers are not fully aware and/or knowledgeable of the applicable federal, state and local laws with regards to the employment of foreign workers.</p> <p>The FMU managers had taken action through a letter PHD.NS.B. 5/1/127 (13) dated 12 July 2012 to the contractor (Compartment 1, Triang FR) of the presence of unregistered Indonesian workers (without sub-licence) within Compartment 1. These workers were still present during the audit in the logging camp. The contractor responded on 5 September 2012 stating that these workers will be terminated.</p> <p>The contractor of Compartment 23 Pelangai FR employed an Indonesia worker without working permit but with valid passport till 2015. The presence of workers without sub-licence shall not be permitted in the FMU area.</p> |
| 1.5.2 | LIM-2 | Minor | <p>There was no record of monitoring on the control of encroachment in the FMU.</p> <p>Assessment consultation with the Orang Asli community in Kg Bukit Kepong indicated that the villagers had increased the area of cultivation in Sg Menyala FR from 5.5 ha in 2009 (recorded by the NSSFD) to about 12 ha in 2012 (claimed by the Orang Asli). The increase was not recorded as this was only claimed by the community.</p> |
| 4.4.1 | LIM-3 | Minor | <p>Forest managers shall evaluate, through consultations, social impact of forest operations directly affecting communities, and the people and groups directly affected by the forest operations shall have access to information on the results of the social impact evaluations;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No report was prepared after the social evaluations were conducted. • Forest planning and management practices have yet to consider and incorporate the results of such evaluations. <p>Social impact evaluation was conducted in the two forest districts (Negeri Sembilan Timur and Barat) before, during and after harvesting activities for Compartment 1, Triang FR and Compartment 23 Pelangai FR but a report on the outcome of social impact evaluation was yet to be prepared by the two forest districts. Since report was still in progress, the findings were not incorporated in forest planning and management practices.</p> |

| | | | |
|-------|-------|-------|--|
| 6.5.2 | SKY-1 | Minor | Harvesting in Compartment 1 Triang FR had resulted in residual trees being damaged producing large gaps in the forest. Harvesting had not strictly adhered to the RIL guidelines. (as this was only observed in one site only a Minor NCR was issued.) |
| 6.5.3 | KN-1 | Minor | <p>The construction of skid trails in Compartment 1 Triang FR. did not follow the specifications as in the Garis Panduan Jalan Hutan, 2010 (Guidelines for Forest Roads, 2010);</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The side walls along the skid trail 3/12 in the Compartment 1 Triang FR exceeded 0.6m. • The water bunds constructed to prevent erosion at skid trail 50/9 and skid trail 3/12 in Compartment 1, Triang FR were not compacted • The construction of skid trail 3/12 had resulted in land slips with soil flowing into the valley. • The construction of silt traps at Block C of Compartment 1 Triang FR did not comply with the specifications on road construction. |
| 9.4.1 | SKY-2 | Minor | The annual monitoring to assess the effectiveness of the measures in the management of the HCVFs in the Sungai Menyala FR for year 2011 and 2012 was not evident. |

OFIs:

| Indicator | OFI No. | Summary of OFI |
|-----------|---------|--|
| 4.1.1 | 1 | <p><u>Forest managers provide appropriate support for training, retraining, local infrastructure, facilities and social programmes that commensurate with the scale and intensity of forest management operations.</u></p> <p>Training records for contractors' workers of Compartment 1, Triang FR and Compartment 23 Pelangai FR should be more systematically documented.</p> |
| 4.2.3 | 2 | <p><u>Appropriate safety and operational equipment in good working condition, including operational procedures, shall be made available to forest workers in the work place.</u></p> <p>Operational procedures on the use of equipment and maintenance of the equipment should be made available to workers of Compartment 1, Triang FR and Compartment 23 Pelangai FR.</p> |

| | | |
|-------|---|--|
| 4.2.4 | 3 | <p><u>Forest managers shall maintain up-to-date safety records in compliance with all applicable laws and/or regulations covering health and safety of forest workers.</u></p> <p>Accident records except for records of medical visits were not adequately maintained in Compartment 1, Triang FR and Compartment 23 Pelangai FR.</p> |
| 6.1.3 | 4 | <p><u>Forest management plan shall incorporate measures to mitigate the environmental impacts identified in the assessments</u></p> <p>The revised FMP could be improved by including the mitigation measures listed in the Macro EIA report of 2007.</p> |
| 6.2.1 | 5 | <p><u>Implementation of procedures to periodically revise the forest management plan, incorporating results of monitoring or new scientific and technical information</u></p> <p>The revised FMP would have to incorporate all the results from the monitoring conducted as well as new technical information. All the sections described in Criterion 7.1 to be included.</p> |
| 7.2.1 | 6 | <p><u>Forest manager shall gather the relevant information appropriate to the scale and intensity of the forest management operations.</u></p> <p>Wildlife/ biodiversity inventory analysis and research should be conducted with relevant stakeholders.</p> |
| 8.1.2 | 7 | <p><u>Forest managers shall identify and implement appropriate monitoring procedures, in accordance with the scale and intensity of the forest management operations, for assessing social, ecological, environmental and economic impacts.</u></p> <p>Social impact evaluation could be improved with standard procedures.</p> |
| 8.2.1 | 8 | <p><u>Forest managers shall consult with relevant stakeholders on the options to maintain or enhance the identified HCVFs</u></p> <p>The relevant stakeholder was consulted during the establishment of HCVF sites, however the stakeholder list had not been updated and records of consultations not presented.</p> |
| 9.2.1 | 9 | <p><u>Forest managers should incorporate the results and findings of the HCVFs monitoring activities into the implementation and revision of the forest management plan.</u></p> |

| | | |
|-------|----|---|
| | | Results obtained from monitoring HCVF sites should be incorporated in the revision of the FMP 2006-2015 |
| 9.4.2 | 10 | <p><u>Availability and implementation of guidelines to identify and protect endangered, rare and threatened species of forest flora and fauna, including features of special biological interest such as seed trees, nesting and feeding areas in the PRFs</u></p> <p>Selection of mother trees in Compartments 1 and 6 of Triang FR should be improved with better quality trees marked as mother trees.</p> |

End of public summary