

Date of Public Summary: July 2011

**PUBLIC SUMMARY OF FIRST SURVEILLANCE AUDIT OF
PERAK STATE FOREST MANAGEMENT UNIT
FOR FOREST MANAGEMENT CERTIFICATION**

**Certificate No : FMC 004
Date of Certification : 7 July 2010
Date of Surveillance Audit : 8-12 November 2010**

Certification Body:

**SIRIM QAS International Sdn Bhd
Block 4, SIRIM Complex
1, Persiaran Dato' Menteri
Section 2, P. O. Box 7035
40700 Shah Alam
Selangor, MALAYSIA**

**Tel : +60 3 5544 6400
+60 3 5544 6448
Fax : +60 3 5544 6763
E-Mail : radziah_mohd.daud@sirim.my**

1. INTRODUCTION

A surveillance audit for forest management certification on the Perak State Forest Management Unit (hereafter referred to as 'the Perak State FMU') was conducted from 8-12 November 2010. This was the first annual surveillance audit conducted following the Stage 2 Audit conducted in 2009 on the overall forest management system and practices of the natural forest in the Permanent Reserved Forest (PRF) within the Perak State FMU against the requirements of the *Malaysian Criteria and Indicators for Forest Management Certification [MC&I (2002)]* using the verifiers stipulated for Peninsular Malaysia.

This surveillance audit was conducted to verify the Perak State FMU's continued compliance with the requirements of the *MC&I (2002)*. The surveillance audit was conducted with the full cooperation of the Perak State Forestry Department (PSFD).

The Perak State Forest Department (PSFD) is responsible for the management of the natural forest in the PRF within the Perak State FMU covering 991,433 ha or about 47.2% of the State's total land area of 2.1 million ha. The administration of the FMU is divided into five forest districts namely the South Perak, Kinta/Manjung, Kuala Kangsar, Larut-Matang and Hulu Perak Forest Districts. The PSFD was still committed to the management of the natural forest in the PRF within the State FMU on a sustainable basis.

The inland forest is managed under a Selective Management System (SMS) on a 30-year rotation period. Under the Ninth Malaysia Plan (2006-2010), the Annual Allowable Cut (AAC) for the Perak State FMU had been set at 7,770 ha. A Forest Management Plan (FMP) covering the period from 2006 to 2015 had been completed and presented during the audit.

During this surveillance audit, the audit team had verified on the corrective actions taken by the PSFD to address the minor NCRs and OFIs raised during the previous Stage 2 Audit. The audit team was satisfied that the corrective actions had been implemented effectively to address these minor NCRs and OFIs and had therefore decided to close out all of them.

2. GENERAL SUMMARY

2.1 Name of FMU

Perak State FMU

2.2 Contact Person and Address

Mr. Salim Aman
Assistant Director of Forestry
Perak State Forestry Department
Persiaran Meru Utama
Bandar Meru Raya
30020 Ipoh
PERAK

Tel : 05-528 8100/ 8071/ 8172/ 8172/ 8173/ 8175

Fax : 05-528 8101

E-mail : salimaman@forestry.gov.my

2.3 **Dates of Surveillance Audit:**

8-12 November 2010 (10 man-days)

2.4 **Audit Team**

Dr. Yap Son Kheong (Audit Team Leader)
Mr. Khairul Najwan Ahmad Jahari (Auditor)

2.5 **Standards Used**

Malaysian Criteria and Indicators for Forest Management Certification [MC&I (2002)] using the verifiers stipulated for Peninsular Malaysia.

2.6 **Stakeholder Consultation**

A stakeholder consultation was conducted in October 2010 for a period of one month before the field audit commenced. Comments by stakeholders and responses from the audit team are attached in **Annex 1**. During the field audit, consultations were also held with the staff of the FMU, and the field workers of the contractor at the harvesting sites.

3. **SUMMARY OF SURVEILLANCE AUDIT FINDINGS**

During this surveillance audit, the audit team had also verified on the corrective actions taken by the PSFD to address the minor NCRs and OFIs raised during the previous Stage 2 Audit. The audit team was satisfied that the corrective actions had been implemented effectively to address these minor NCRs and OFIs and had therefore decided to close out all of them. However, a new major NCR, two (2) minor NCRs and four (4) OFIs had been raised during this surveillance audit.

The PSFD had submitted a corrective action plan to address these NCRs and OFIs which was received by SIRIM QAS International Sdn Bhd (SIRIM QAS International) on 29 December 2010. The audit team was satisfied with the corrective actions taken by the PSFD to address the new major NCR and had therefore closed it out without on-site verification as they were related to documentations. The proposed corrective actions by the PSFD to address the minor NCRs and OFIs shall be verified by the audit team during the next surveillance audit.

The details on the status of the NCRs and OFIs raised during the previous Stage 2 audit, and the new NCRs and OFIs raised during this surveillance audit are attached in **Annex 2**.

As there was no outstanding major NCR, the audit team therefore recommends that the *Certificate for Forest Management* awarded to the PSFD be maintained.

Comments by Stakeholders and Responses by the Audit Team

No	Name	Organisation	Address and Contact Numbers	Date Received	Detail of Issue Raised	Comments by Audit Team Leader
1.	Stakeholder 1	-	-	5 November 2010	We were informed in a recent meeting in Gopeng that 6 High Conservation Value Forest (HCVF) has been declared in the Perak FMU. We noted with concern that we were not consulted prior to these declaration. We have ongoing forest-related conservation work and have identified hotspots with HCV attributes. Hence we would like to strongly encourage the Perak State Forestry Department to conduct a FMU-Level consultation to identify forests with HCVF with the Society.	<p>A meeting on the establishment of a HCVF site in Compartment 191, Bukit Kinta Forest Reserve of the Kinta Manung Forest District was convened by the Perak State Forestry Department on 19 October 2010. The meeting was attended by various governmental agencies (Land Office and, Department of Town and Country Planning), representatives from the local communities (Pejabat Penghulu Mukim Teja, JKKK Ulu Geroh, members of the Semai Community of Kg. Ulu Geroh, and Persatuan Semai) and representatives from Malaysian Nature Society.</p> <p>This meeting was called to discuss on the establishment of a HCVF site for the Rafflesia plant commonly found in the area. This was in response to the need for stakeholders' consultation in establishing a HCVF site of importance to local communities and NGOs. The previous HCVF sites which were established had been done through the advice of local research institutions and universities especially on sites with</p>

						<p>rare, threatened and endangered species. To prevent poachers from getting to the protected sites some were not made known in public reports. As identification of HCVF sites is an ongoing process, more sites which are within the Permanent Reserved Forest (Hutan Simpan Kekal) and fulfilling the attributes of HCVF as defined under the FSC would be identified. Consultations with the relevant stakeholders (including Stakeholder 1) would then be conducted.</p> <p>.</p>
					<p>MC&I Indicator 7.4.1 – Public Summary of the Forest Management Plan (FMP) still not available after we raised this matter in the main assessment a year ago. Public summary should be made easily accessible and should contain all elements listed in 7.1</p>	<p>The public summary is presently available upon request from the Perak State Forestry Department head office. Once the website of the State Government is upgraded, the public summary of the important elements of the FMP would be posted on the Perak State government web page. The Perak State Forestry Department is also in the process of working with the Forestry Department HQ Peninsular Malaysia on the possibility of putting the summary of the FMP on the latter's web page.</p>
					<p>MC&I Indicator 8.5.1 - Monitoring summary is also not available to date. This information is needed by stakeholders to be more involved and informed about the process</p>	<p>A summary of all the results of monitoring had yet to be made publicly available. This was raised as minor NCR during the surveillance audit where the PSFD</p>

					hence should be make available to public in detail.	would have to address it.
					<p>Poaching – noted with concern the rampant poaching activities in Perak, elevated hides built at saltlicks, published documentaries (see http://link.brightcove.com/services/player/bcpid4523559001?bclid=0&bctid=67649015001). We would like to know what measures are forest managers taking to counter these activities? Are current measures adequate and any indicators to prove that they are effective?</p>	<p>The video on the said documentary could not be viewed. The problem of poaching within the forest reserve had been raised. PSFD had a meeting with the State Department of Wildlife and National Park (PERHILITAN) on 8 Dec 2009 to discuss on the proposal to conduct joint enforcement on illegal poaching in the Temenggor and Belum Forest Reserves. In an effort to further reduce encroachment into the FMU, the PSFD had conducted a joint meeting with the <i>Ikatan Relawan Rakyat Malaysia</i> or <i>Volunteers of Malaysian People</i> (RELA), Police and PERHILITAN on illegal activities in the forest reserves on 8 June 2010. The PSFD had taken action to construct a gate and guarded the main access road into the Temenggor FR. With the size of the forest and the many possible entry points into the forests from the existing roads as well as from the surrounding lake, these steps taken could only reduce incidences of poaching. The PSFD welcome any public information on illegal hunting and poaching to assist them in further reducing the occurrence of such incidences.</p>
					Infrastructure development planning	Inspection made on 9 November

					<p>should consider ecological function of the area – our member reported that road/path was built right across saltlick. What action/measures are forest managers taking to mitigate such irresponsible actions? The member further added that “I’ve attached a picture of the saltlick/hotspring in the foreground with the logging road visible immediately behind it. The GPS reference is 5°29’31.03”N 100°57’5.82”E. The saltlick is easily accessed from the new Grik-Baling highway just a few km away. Evidence on the ground suggests that many people, including bird trappers, visit the site.”</p>	<p>2010 of the site identified had shown that the road was constructed by the Tenaga Nasional Berhad (TNB) in the Bintang Hijau FR. The site is located about 1.5 km from the Gerik-Kupang Road just before the rest area. The road is running next to a stream that flows through a salt lick. Signs of animal presence were observed during the inspection. The PSFD would be informing PERHILITAN on the presence of the salt lick.</p>
					<p>In the Public Summary of the certification report for Perak FMU by the certification body, the location of saltlick was published. It is in our opinion that details of the location (e.g. GPS coordinates should not be published as this information could be misused by alerting and ‘facilitate’ poachers to these saltlicks</p>	<p>The coordinates had been deleted from the Public Summary.</p>
2.	Stakeholder 2			21 October 2010	<p>I am taking the liberty of writing to you after visiting a logged area last week in the Piah Forest Reserve in Perak. I attach some photos of the environment which would seem to call for some investigation about the logging practice, which has caused severe erosion and damage to the watercourses. I hope to follow up by arranging to meet with you sometime</p>	<p>An inspection on the site reported was done on 10 November 2010. The forest area of 400 ha, which is located next to Compartment 130 of the Piah FR had been alienated as state land for agricultural planting by the Federal Land Development Authority (FELDA). The compartment licenced for harvesting within the Piah FR had</p>

				<p>at our mutual convenience, as I have observed other areas similarly affected.</p> <p>As your staff will know, I was the Chairman of the Malaysian Forestry Research & Development Board (FRIM) from 2001 to 2004, and have also been active in botanical fieldwork and taxonomic research (as Publisher/Editor of the journal <i>Folia malaysiana</i>), and there may be many areas of mutual concern regarding botanical research and conservation.</p> <p>I look forward to hearing from you.</p>	<p>followed the specifications of the licence. Buffer zone for the river was maintained.</p>
				<p>Clearing of forest area in Sg. Limau</p>	<p>A report was presented by the District Forestry Officer to the State Forestry Director on 11 November 2010. Two activities were reported next to Compartment 47 of the Sungai Limau FR. The first was the digging of a fish crap pond by the local communities since February 2010. The site had been confirmed by the State Land Department to be outside the forest reserve.</p> <p>The second was another pond dug about 600 metres from the first, covering 0.26 ha of about a week old. As this pond was within the forest reserve more signage had been erected to indicate the forest reserve and replanting with</p>

						<p>mangrove species would be conducted.</p> <p>More patrol of the area had been initiated. An inspection of the site was conducted on 11 November 2010 during this surveillance audit.</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

**Status of the NCRs and OFIs Issued during the Previous Stage 2 Audit
and the Issuance of New NCRs and OFIs under the Current Surveillance Audit**

Status of NCRs and OFIs issued during the previous Stage 2 Audit

Indicator	NCR No.	Details of Non Compliance	Corrective Actions Taken	Status
4.1.1	Minor 1	<p>Interview with Orang Asli forest workers from Kg. Chiong in Hutan Simpan Temenggor indicated that there was no training provided on loading of logs onto lorries. This absence of training was also observed when chainsaw operators in Compartment 107 Temenggor FR under license PPN.Pk 67/2009B and PPN.Pk 114/2008B were interviewed.</p> <p>Forest workers employed by the logging contractors have not been sufficiently trained on proper harvesting techniques.</p>	<p>The PSFD had in December 2009 initiated training programs on harvesting operations with the cooperation and support of the Perak Timber Association. A series of training sessions had been conducted on the implementation of <i>MC&I</i> (2002), specifications of forest roads, directional felling and RIL techniques for both the workers of the contractors and staff of the Department from February to November 2010.</p>	This minor NCR was closed out.
4.2.3	Minor 2	<p>During the inspection of Air Ganda nursery located at Compartment 3 Papulut FR on 31 October 2009, it was observed that there was inadequate protective apparel provided to the worker. There was also no designated mixing container and appropriate container to measure out amount the chemical required before mixing with water. The worker was not able to demonstrate the appropriate actions required to deal with emergency situation.</p> <p>Personal Safety Equipment (PPE) and operational equipment for spraying chemical were not adequate.</p>	<p>All the nurseries had since then been provided with appropriate equipment and PPE for application of chemicals.</p>	This minor NCR was closed out.
5.1.2	Minor 3	<p>During the inspection of the active logging site at Compartments 11, 17 and 18, Pondok Tanjung Forest Reserve, Larut Matang Forest District under the license PPN.PK 47/2009B (HSK/LM), it was observed that</p>	<p>The PSFD had initiated a trial in the Temenggor Forest Reserve to tag trees for felling under the <i>Guidelines for Tree Tagging Procedure for Harvesting at 85m³ per ha</i>. This</p>	This minor NCR was closed out.

		<p>harvesting had produced large canopy openings and the area was impoverished of healthy commercial trees</p> <p>Harvesting operations has resulted in poor residual stand with large canopy openings. The residual stand will be of low productivity and not able to recover within the cutting cycle.</p>	<p>new procedure was to space out trees to be harvested to reduce the presence of large canopy openings.</p>	
5.3.1	Minor 4	<p>During the inspection of the active logging site in Compartment 18 Bintang Hijau FR, Kuala Kangsar Forest District under the license PPN.PK 73/2009B (HSK/KK) and Compartments 11, 17 and 18, Pondok Tanjung Forest Reserve, Larut Matang Forest District under the license PPN.PK 47/2009B (HSK/LM), it was observed that construction of skid trails did not adhere to that drawn on the harvesting plans. It was also observed that one of the feeder road constructed differed from that specified in the harvesting plan. It was reported that an application had been made for the change but approval by the forest manager had not been given</p> <p>The access roads and skid trails were constructed not according to the harvesting plan.</p>	<p>In November 2009 notices to stop work had been issued to the contractors responsible and they were instructed to make application for any amendments made to the alignments of roads and skid trails. Additional conditions had also been added to the harvesting licences requiring the contractors to mark all skid trails and feeder roads prior to commencement of logging. Training courses on road specifications and RIL were conducted in February 2010 and October 2010 respectively.</p>	This minor NCR was closed out.
5.5.1	Minor 7	<p>Inspection of harvesting sites in Compartment 145 and 146 Temenggor FR during the verification assessment had shown that part of the area harvested were above 1000 m.</p> <p>It was found that trees located at 1,130 m elevation were tagged for felling and some had been harvested. Trees above the 1000m elevation are prohibited from felling and this encroachment above this elevation is a serious nonconformance with the Indicator.</p>	<p>Rehabilitation planting had been carried out in the affected area. A Task Force had been established to re-assess and determine all licenced areas have correct boundaries.</p>	This minor NCR was closed out.
6.5.1	Major 5	<p>During the inspection of the active logging site in Compartment 18 Bintang Hijau FR, Kuala Kangsar Forest District under license PPN.PK 73/2009B (HSK/KK), it was observed that excessive earthworks</p>	<p>Corrective actions taken by the PSFD to address this Major NCR was verified in December 2009.</p>	This major NCR was closed out.

		<p>occurred during road construction although the logging was only 30% completed. Much of the excess soil was pushed to the side and not compacted resulting in being washed into the forest during rains. It was reported that some excess soil had to be transported out. Excessive blading of the roads were also found in Compartments 11, 17 and 18, Pondok Tanjung Forest Reserve, Larut Matang Forest District under the license PPN.PK 47/2009B (HSK/LM) where the terrain was gentle and only minimum blading is required.</p> <p>In the construction of roads, there were excessive earthworks due to deep blading. Side walls were found to be steep resulting in landslips. Retaining walls at side of bridges were not able to retain the excessive soil produced. The excess soil that was pushed to the side of roads was not compacted as specified under RIL.</p>		
6.5.4	Major 6	<p>During the inspection of the active logging site at Compartments 11, 17 and 18, Pondok Tanjung Forest Reserve, Larut Matang Forest District under the license PPN.PK 47/2009B (HSK/LM), it was found that three untagged trees were logged in the buffer zone. A skid trail was also constructed into the buffers and residues of fallen trees were found inside the buffer zone. Damages to buffer belt were also observed in Compartment 37 Bubu FR and Compartment 18 Bintang Hijau FR, Kuala Kangsar Forest District under the license PPN.PK 73/2009B (HSK/KK) where trees were also felled. Excess soil was resulting from road construction was pushed into the riparian buffers in the second site. Felled trees were removed from these sites.</p> <p>Riparian buffers were violated and trees within the riparian buffers removed. Skid trails were constructed into the buffers. Residues of fallen trees were found in the buffers. These felled trees were removed without being detected.</p>	Corrective actions taken by the PSFD to address this major NCR was verified in December 2009.	This major NCR was closed out.

Indicator	OFI No.	Summary of OFI	Corrective Actions Taken	Status
1.5.2	1	There is a need to enhance cooperation and joint operations between the PSFD with the State Parks and Wildlife Department (PERHILITAN) to reduce poaching in the FMU.	PSFD had a meeting with the Department of Wildlife and National Park (PERHILITAN) on 8 Dec 2009 to discuss on the proposal to conduct joint enforcement on illegal poaching in the Temenggor and Belum Forest Reserves. It had also appointed a licensed external surveyor to re-survey the outer boundary of the FMU. In an effort to further reduce encroachment into the FMU, the PSFD had conducted a joint meeting with the <i>Ikatan Relawan Rakyat Malaysia</i> (RELA), Police and PERHILITAN on illegal logging in the forest reserves on 8 June 2010.	This OFI was closed out.
4.2.4	2	It was observed that there was no monthly record being kept on the occurrence of accidents. The existing form contains only records on attendance and remarks. Only if the worker is absent from work will the reason is recorded in the remark section. The present documentation system could be improved by maintaining a monthly record on occurrences of accidents.	Monthly reports on accidents from March to July 2010 were presented by the contractor in Compartment 138 of the Temenggor Forest Reserve.	This OFI was closed out.
4.4.1	3	The information gathered during the four social impact assessments conducted in 1 Orang Asli village and 3 Malay villages was inadequate. The completed forms on the social impact assessment for Kg. Orang Asli Lubuk Legong, Kg. Ulu Tawar/Padang Belon, Kg. Bendang Man and Kg. Batu 7, Jalan Kroh, Baling showed a lack of basic information (such as population, economic activities, dependence on non-timber forest produce and services). The methods of data collection and sources of data should be outlined in the reports. The dependence on the forest by the local Orang Asli and Malay communities had to be defined.	The assessment form had been amended to include method of data collection such as questionnaire, consultation and formal meeting with the village committee.	This OFI was closed out.

6.2.1	4	Additional efforts would have to be undertaken by the PSFD to address the concern by NGO on the decline in the population of hornbills. Protection of nesting trees especially those with hollow trunks would be identified during tree tagging and protected for fauna.	A training course on the management of wildlife for the uniformed staff was done in June 2010. A follow-up training on the recognition of endangered, rare and threatened species was conducted for the staff of the PSFD.	This OFI was closed out.
6.7.2	5	During the inspection of the active logging areas, generally it was found that fuel containers had been properly stored and disposed as scheduled waste. However, it was found that in the Temenggor FR, some fuel containers had not been stored properly. Fuel storage tanks should have been properly contained in the logging camps as well as in the field.	A briefing on the proper storage of fuel and non organic wastes was included in the RIL course provided to contractors and workers in October 2010.	This OFI was closed out.
8.1.2	6	A special form entitled "Panduan Maklumat Kajian Impak Sosial Dalam Sektor Pembalakan Sebelum, Semasa dan Selepas Pembalakan: Kesan Terhadap Faktor Sosial" has been used to monitor the social impacts. The form contains information on environment, flora and fauna diversity, economic, infrastructure, health, social stability, settlement, land use, traditional customs, cultural and religious practices, and conflict. The form needs to be further improved by adding another column on the potential impacts on the water sources used by local communities. The presence of burial ground (if any) should be determined and the use of non-timber forest produce be recorded.	The required information had been added to the form.	This OFI was closed out.
9.4.1	7	To further enhance the attributes of HCVF in all sites, a systematic monitoring and consultations with the relevant stakeholders would be required.	A meeting on the establishment of a HCVF site in Compartment 191, Bukit Kinta Forest Reserve of the Kinta Manung Forest District was convened by the Perak State Forestry Department on 19 October 2010. The meeting was attended by various governmental agencies (Land Office and, Department of Town and Country Planning), representatives from the local communities (Pejabat Penghulu Mukim Teja, JKKK Ulu Geroh, members of the Semai Community of Kg. Ulu Geroh, and Persatuan	This OFI was closed out.

			Semai) and representatives from Malaysian Nature Society.	
6.3.3	8	<p>Sites identified as important for the forest fauna such as salt licks have to be demarcated during tree tagging phase with the guidance of relevant authorities and protected with a buffer belt of sufficient width following consultation with the Department of Wildlife and National Parks.</p> <p><i>(This OFI was raised during the verification audit)</i></p>	This OFI is dependent on the meetings with the PERHILITAN.	

Issuance of New NCRs and OFIs under the Current Surveillance Audit

NCRs:

Indicator	NCR No.	Status	Summary of Non Compliance
1.5.2	SKY01	Major	<p>Two trees were felled and taken out from an adjacent compartment outside of Compartment 138 (Licence no. PPN.PK. 42/2010 B (HSK/HPK) in Temenggor Forest Reserve.</p> <p><i>Note: The PSFD had charged RM 2,000 (compound) and RM 3,599.46 (royalty and cess) on the licence holder for the offence committed. The audit team was satisfied that the action taken by the PSFD had been appropriate and decided to close-out this major NCR.</i></p>
8.3.1	KN01	Minor	<p>During the inspection of the records from Lawin Checking Station in Grik Forest District and Lasah Checking Station in Kuala Kangsar Forest District it was observed that 9 logs that were transported out as recorded in the Removal Passes (species, log diameters and lengths) were not documented as removed in the Tree Tagging Book;</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Removal Pass no 856051 dated 3 November 2010 for License PPN.PK 1B/2010 B, HSK. HPK Hulu Perak (Lawin Checking Station) 5 logs 2) Removal pass no 851512 dated 11 October 2010 for License PPN.PK 96/2010 B, HSK/KK (Lasah Checking Station) 4 logs
8.5.1	SKY01	Minor	<p>Growth rates, regeneration and conditions of the forest; composition and observed changes in the flora and fauna and environmental and social impacts of harvesting had not been published in the annual report made available to the public.</p>

OFIs:

Indicator	OFI No.	Status	Summary of OFI
4.2.3	1	-	Records of appropriate maintenance of safety and operational equipment had not been documented in a system with the equipment and dates of maintenance recorded.
4.2.4	2	-	Records of accidents of forest workers have not included that of contractors' workers.

8.2.1	3	-	During the inspection in Comp 138 HS Temenggor it was observed that the species recorded for a tree stump was different from that recorded in tagging book.
9.3.2	4	-	The annual report for 2009 had been prepared for publication and will have to include measures to enhance HCVF in the public summary available in the web site.